# 1 Document Details

| Authors | Sabina Popit, City of Ljubljana  
Nadja Železnik, REC Poland |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contact</td>
<td>Sabina Popit, email:<a href="mailto:sabina.popit@ljubljana.si">sabina.popit@ljubljana.si</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creation Date</td>
<td>March 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date of Last Revision</td>
<td>April 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Description</td>
<td>This report is one of the deliverables on the task of WP 4.4.1. Mutual Learning Workshops (MLW). The workshop was held with stakeholders to share and discuss the health risk factors of their changing city environment now and within the timescale of the future scenarios (2020-2030-2050). The current report contains the general concept, the summary of the MLW, the scenario outputs and conclusions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

# 2 Version History

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Version</th>
<th>Updated By</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Changes / Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| V1      | Sabina Popit, City of Ljubljana  
Nadja Železnik, REC Poland | March 2018 | Version 1 |
| V2      | Eva Csobod, REC | April 2018 | Version 2 |
| V3      | Sabina Popit, City of Ljubljana  
Nadja Železnik, REC Poland | April 2018 | Version 3 |
3 Contributions and Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank the following people for their important contributions used in the preparation of this final document.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quality Assurance</th>
<th>Corra Boushel (UWE), Eva Csobod (REC)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Native Language Check</td>
<td>Corra Boushel (UWE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project internal comments</td>
<td>Internal comments ask for detailed information on the stakeholder groups and the conclusions of the MLW.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

1 Document Details...........................................................................................................2
2 Version History................................................................................................................2
3 Contributions and Acknowledgements.........................................................................3
4 Executive Summary.........................................................................................................5
5 Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshop in Ljubljana..................................................7
   5.1.1 Facilitators ............................................................................................................ Error! Bookmark not defined.
   5.1.2 Participants and organisations ..............................................................................7
   5.1.3 Logistics.............................................................................................................. Error! Bookmark not defined.
   5.1.4 Resources .......................................................................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
6 Agenda......................................................................................................................... Error! Bookmark not defined.
7 Course of the workshop.................................................................................................8
   7.1.1 Welcome and introduction ..................................................................................8
   7.1.2 Plenary session ....................................................................................................8
   7.1.3 Workshop session ..............................................................................................10
   7.1.4 Conclusions ......................................................................................................12
4 Executive Summary

The Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshop (MLW) in Ljubljana took place on 15th of March 2018 on the premises of Ljubljana municipality City Hall. The workshop was attended by 15 participants from different institutions and non-governmental sectors with the aim to discuss the possibilities for improvement of air quality in the city and to decrease the health impacts for future.

The MLW was divided in two parts, first covering the theoretical findings relevant for the city and presenting some of the recent national and international projects. The second part was based on the real field tour and the question of how to improve sustainable mobility in the area.

The area of focus was from City Hall to the first bridge over Ljubljanica (Šuštarski most), to Krakovski nasip and back on the other side of Ljubljanica to City Hall.

All participants discussed the current arrangements and possibilities for the improvements and enlargements of the pedestrian zone. This area is partly already free of traffic with exception of electric cars providing services for the municipality (Kavalir). They combine the pedestrian zone with areas for bicycles, but this is not very well organized, a lot of spaces for restaurants, pubs and the recently refurbished banks of the Ljubljanica river. On one side there is still a street with cars. The Ljubljanica river is navigable and a kind of river transport is already organised.

The participants were innovative and discussed the possible improvement of situation, by increasing measures which are already now available (like, pedestrian zones, shared spaces, electric cars, Kavalir for vulnerable individuals, Bicikel service).

Participants also introduced new ideas like improvements of the heat supply system to avoid the use of wood, use of river Ljubljanica for transportation and introduction of new green and water elements to be enjoyed by citizens.
5 Introduction

This activity is part of the work package Citizens and Stakeholder Engagement, WP4.4 – Citizens and their Health, Task 4.4.1 Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshop.

The aim is to empower citizens to better understand the specific challenges and opportunities that their city currently offers and engage them into moving towards reduce pollutants emissions and carbon footprints, improved air quality and decreased health risks. This is achieved as part of overall perceptions and ideas of citizens on sustainable lifestyles and a ‘better quality of life’ within their city in the future. The main outcomes will support the policy development of the cities towards 2050 in the field of integrated city planning, air quality and climate change.

REC (WP4 lead) are responsible for the design of the Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshops (henceforth, Mutual Learning Workshops or MLW); the content, methodology, structure, the potential stakeholders and timeframe. The MLW is implemented by the partners and cities/regions.
6 Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshop in Ljubljana

Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshop (MLW) in Ljubljana took place on 15th of March 2018 on the premises of Ljubljana municipality City Hall.

6.1.1 MLW Concept and Workshop Aim

The MLW is designed for stakeholders who are engaged in environment, health issues and policies.

The aim of the event is to discuss and identify routes to a “clean air”, healthy, zero-carbon region by 2050 by understanding specific challenges and opportunities for organisations, and engaging them to identify actions, milestones and priorities.

6.1.2 Participants and organisations

The MLW was attended by 17 participants. In total there were 7 persons from academia, 6 from authorities and 4 from NGOs. The attendees were having background from geography, architecture, health, medicine, economy, landscape and urbanists, security, physics and chemistry. Invitation was sent to the representatives of non-governmental organization CIPRA, Faculty of Art (Department for Geography), Faculty of social science (Department for spatial sociology), Faculty of Architecture and urban planning, Institute for transfer and knowledge application at the Faculty of Health, IPOP – Institute for spatial policies, EUDAIMONIA – Institute for society of quality life and Environmental center, that is connecting several NGOs in Ljubljana, working on Clair City connected topics.
7 Workshop summary

At the MLW there were four speakers, two from the National Health Institute, as they had worked on a LIFE EU project MED HISS, and two representatives from National Urban Institute, that are now working on a national project VENZA ZDRAVJE (Out for health). They are all great experts at the field of health in urban environment.

7.1.1 Welcome and introduction

The MLW started with welcome introduction given by Municipality Ljubljana representative Ms. Sabina Popit. She presented the ClairCity project, the main objectives of the project, how it is performed and who are the participants.

7.1.2 Plenary session

In this part, two presentations were held as introduction and presentation of the overall context of air quality, climate change/management and health impacts on national and city level. In total four keynote speakers were selected and develop the relevant presentations with focus on the current health risk factors and the quality of the city environment.

The first presentation was given by Ms. Simona Perčič with co-author Ms. Simona Uršič from National Institute for public health with the overview of EU LIFE project MED-HISS focusing on the impacts of air pollution on public health.

They presented the findings of WHO and other national organizations that air pollution is one of the major factors for health problems within the population. Almost 90% of city populations worldwide are exposed to values above the limits of PM10, PM2,5, NOX, O3 and benzene in the air. In addition, transport in cities is one of the major causes of air pollution, which statistically impact the health of newborns and is also cause of premature births. She talked about the impact of particles for health and presented results of several studies performed to evaluate effects of different pollutants.

Ms. Perčič then spoke about the results of the MED-HISS project, EU LIFE project covering several Mediterranean states, including Slovenia. The aim was to assess the health impact of long term exposure to pollutants in outdoor air, to support with evidence the changes of EU legislation and to develop new epidemiological surveillance measures with the data collected.
from the environmental monitoring of air pollution, modelling and national health data (Figure 3). It was clear that the most vulnerable groups of citizens are patients with chronic diseases, children, elderly population and physically active people.

In the course of the project the common approach for the assessment of increased risk for health problems due to the air pollution was developed and is now available for future estimations. The most important aspects of the methodological approach used were spatial resolution of pollutant release estimates (4.4 km in horizontal resolution of the internal (nesting) calculation area with 185 × 167 calculating cells) and the pooling of data at the municipal level.

Ms Ina Šuklje Erjašec, UI RS (National Urban Institute) presented work on a national project VEN ZA ZDRAVJE (Out for health) which focuses on health and planning green areas for a healthier environment and public space in connection with physical activities of the population. The project is supported by Ministry of Health and will last until 2019.

Green areas affect the health and mood of people, including, trees, forests, water resources, parks and similar. Ljubljana has already well organized green spaces. Green areas are ecosystems that implement ecosystem services. Green areas support a healthy lifestyle and activate their users. The most common needs associated with green areas which are perceived by users are: contact with nature, breathing fresh air, the realization of creativity, the implementation of recreational and other activities. The project VEN ZA ZDRAVJE is addressing the justification and demonstration of measures to increase the use green areas: motivation and perception, accessibility and security, long-lasting mobility, participation in co-creation, space characteristics for individual activities, space planning (holistic, systemic and integral). The problem of planning green areas is the
implementation of plans, so awareness of decision makers is needed so that they can understand the whole process.

Mr. Luka Mladenovič (also UI RS) added the presentation on sustainable mobility with different concepts available in theory but also from the view of future possible developments. Sustainable mobility includes several possible transports: walking, cycling, public transport, special available services (Kavalir), use of Ljubljanica river.

Mr Omladič presented the elements of sustainable mobility with cycle paths.

7.1.3 Workshop session

The workshop was introduced by Ms Sabina Popit, who presented the main aims of the workshop: as Ljubljana city started to close the center for motor traffic already several years ago, now the city would like to increase the pedestrian zones to other connected areas.

The workshop was organized with a guided tour and then to work within two groups to prepare the possible vision for this particular part until 2020, 2030 and 2050. The following programs and strategies were relevant:

- Until 2020: Environment protection program, Sustainable urban strategy and local energy concept;
- Until 2030: Ideal city – sustainable city – the Slovene capital, comprehensive traffic strategy
- Until 2050: Zero waste – the cultural changes

The participants first attended the guided tour in the area of interest for the further work: it started at the City Hall to the first bridge over Ljubljanica (Šušterski most), then continued on that side of the river to Krakovski nasip and turned back on the other side of Ljubljanica to City Hall.

All participants discussed the current arrangements and possibilities for the improvements
and enlargements of the pedestrian zone. This area is partly already free of traffic with exception of electric cars providing services for the municipality (Kavalir). They combine the pedestrian zone with areas for bicycles, but not very well organized, a lot of spaces for restaurants, pubs and the recently refurbished banks of Ljubljanica river. On one side there is still a street with cars. The Ljubljanica river is navigable and a kind of river transport is already organised.

After return to the meeting place, the participants were divided in two groups and asked to develop the strategy for area of interest until 2020, 2030 and 2050 with possible measures. The group were divided in a way to have participants with different background education. Those who had given the introductory lectures were involved in the groups.

The results of the two groups are presented in the table 1, where the year indicated the plans for certain time in the future, strategies 1 and measures 1 are product of group 1, strategies 2 and measures 2 are product of group 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Strategies 1</th>
<th>Measures 1</th>
<th>Strategies 2</th>
<th>Measures 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2020</td>
<td>Promotion of adopted strategies</td>
<td>Closing of roads for individual transport for several days,</td>
<td>Vegetation of riparian area</td>
<td>Continuous and linked cycling routes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Improvement of quality of living</td>
<td>More green elements in the traffic streets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>More stations for Bicikel (bikes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Promotion of sustainable mobility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2030</td>
<td>Ljubljana city for all generations</td>
<td>Increase of green spaces and green infrastructure with multifunctional role</td>
<td>Sustainable mobility</td>
<td>Relief of Zois street for traffic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Burn calories not gas</td>
<td>Spread of inner pedestrian ring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2050</td>
<td>Strategy for implementation of adopted strategies</td>
<td>The center of city is free of cars, the delivery is arranged</td>
<td>Modern, innovative city</td>
<td>Complete electrification of public transport</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The ideas were discussed by both groups. The final vision of the area of interest was:

- increase the traffic free zone to the wider area,
- establish the shared space which is in use in a very busy area of Ljubljana,
- increase the number of Bicikel (bicycle) stations,
- introduce transport on the Ljubljanica river regular stations,
- replace all public transport with electric buses and cars,
- increase the number of vehicles for older people and others in need (Kavalir type of individual transportation linking to public transportation).

In addition, the city would need to work on restoration of green areas, including new water elements (fountains and drinking water areas). Another systematic solution for cleaner air is complete public heating system which is currently not available.

### 7.1.4 Conclusions

The Mutual Learning Stakeholder Workshop (MLW) in Ljubljana took place on 15th of March 2018 on the premises of Ljubljana municipality City Hall. The workshop was attended by 15 participants from different institutions and non-governmental sectors with the aim to discuss the possibilities for improvement of air quality in the city and to decrease the health impacts for future.

The MLW was divided in two parts, first covering the theoretical findings relevant for the city and presenting some of the recent national and international projects. The second part was based on the real field tour and the question of how to improve sustainable mobility in the area. The participants were innovative and discussed the possible improvement of situation, also by increasing measures which are already now available (like, pedestrian zones, shared spaces, electric cars, Kavalir for vulnerable individuals, Bicikel service).

Participants also introduced new ideas like improvements of the heat supply system to avoid the use of wood, use of river Ljubljanica for transportation and introduction of new green and water elements to be enjoyed by citizens.
The MLW provides a good tool for discussion the possible vision, strategies and measures for improvement of air quality in the city. Therefore, it is advised to be used also on regular basis by the city authority.
8 Appendix A – Logistics

8.1.1 Facilitators

- Sabina Popit, City of Ljubljana
- Nadja Železnik, REC Poland

8.1.2 Participants and organisations

- ZARJA ZRINSKI University of Ljubljana Faculty of Health Sciences
- TINA ŠKURJANC Faculty of Health Sciences
- JENA JAMŠEK Faculty of Health Sciences
- SIMONA PERNČič National Health Institute
- NADJA ŽELEZNIK REC
- NINA KONVALINKA EUDAIMONIA, Institute for society of qualitative life
- LUKA MADENOVIČ Urban planning institute of the Republic of Slovenia
- KLEMEN GOSTIČ Institute of traffic and transport Ljubljana
- BLAŽ JAMŠEK Institute of traffic and transport Ljubljana
- INA ŠKRJE ERJAVEC Urban planning institute of the Republic of Slovenia
- ŽAN PLEVNIK Faculty of Architecture, Urbanism
- MIHA ŠETINA Faculty of Architecture, Architecture
- NIKA LAKOVIČ Faculty of Architecture, Architecture
- NUŠA JERIČ Faculty of Architecture, Architecture
- TJAŠA TEKAVČIČ City of Ljubljana (Safe routes to school coordinator)
- SABINA POPIT City of Ljubljana
- MARUŠA KUNAVER City of Ljubljana

8.1.3 Logistics

A big room was used for the plenary section and other for the group activities. Prior to the meeting, the tables were organized for group work, the posters were posted and materials were put on the tables. For the working group sessions, a series of power point slides were prepared and presented, aiming to help the moderator to explain the tasks and the participants to better understand what they were asked to do at each step.

8.1.4 Resources

- Participant sign-up sheet
- Participant information sheets
- Consent forms
- Large posters for Ljubljana 2020, Ljubljana 2030, challenges and barriers, Ljubljana 2050
- Ppt slide presentation
9 Appendix B – Agenda

The agenda of the Ljubljana Mutual Learning Workshop was based on the MLW guidelines and adapted to the local habits and time schedules.